

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
WESTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON**

JOSE CASTAÑEDA JUAREZ; J [REDACTED] A [REDACTED] -
M [REDACTED]; WILFREDO FAVELA AVENDANO; and
NAEEM SOHAIL KHAN

Petitioners-Plaintiffs,

v.

NATHALIE ASHER, Director of the Seattle Field Office
of U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement;
MATTHEW T. ALBENCE, Deputy Director and Senior
Official Performing the Duties of the Director of the U.S.
Immigration and Customs Enforcement; U.S.
IMMIGRATION AND CUSTOMS ENFORCEMENT;
STEVEN LANGFORD, Warden, Tacoma Northwest
Detention Center,

Respondents-
Defendants.

Case No. 2:20-cv-00700-RSM-
MLP

**BRIEF OF AMICI CURIAE
PUBLIC HEALTH
OFFICIALS**

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Table of Authorities ii

I. Introduction..... 1

II. Statement of Interest of *Amici Curiae* 2

III. Factual Background 4

IV. Argument 4

 A. The COVID-19 Pandemic Requires Proactive Social Distancing
 Measures 4

 B. The Danger Is Greatest for People Over 50 or with Underlying
 Illnesses..... 5

 C. Detention Centers Are at a Heightened Risk for the Spread of
 COVID-19..... 6

 D. IHSC’s Recommendations to Combat COVID-19 Are Inadequate 9

V. Conclusion 10

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

Page(s)

AUTHORITIES

Alexis C. Madrigal & Robinson Meyer, *How the Coronavirus Became an American Catastrophe*, *The Atlantic* (Mar. 21, 2020), <https://www.theatlantic.com/health/archive/03/2020/how-many-americans-are-sick-lost-february/608521/>.....5

Andrew Jacobs, et al., ‘At War With No Ammo’: Doctors Say Shortage of Protective Gear Is Dire, *N.Y. Times* (Mar. 19, 2020) <https://www.nytimes.com/2020/03/19/health/coronavirus-masks-shortage.html>.....8

Apoora Mandavilli, *Infected but Feeling Fine: The Unwitting Coronavirus Spreaders*, *N.Y. Times* (Mar. 31, 2020) <https://www.nytimes.com/2020/03/31/health/coronavirus-asymptomatic-transmission.html>.....8

Bianca Malcolm, *The Rise of Methicillin-Resistant Staphylococcus aureus in U.S. Correctional Populations*, *Journal of Correctional Health Care* (May 13, 2011), <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC3116074/>;.....7

Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, *Coronavirus Disease 2019 (COVID-19): Cases and Latest Updates*, <https://www.cdc.gov/coronavirus/2019-ncov/cases-updates/cases-in-us.html> (last updated May 6, 2020)6

Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, *Coronavirus Disease 2019 (COVID-19): Situation Summary (2020)*, <https://www.cdc.gov/coronavirus/2019-ncov/summary.html>5, 6

David Reuter, *Swine Flu Widespread in Prisons and Jails, but Deaths are Few*, *Prison Legal News* (Feb. 15, 2010), <https://www.prisonlegalnews.org/news/2010/feb/15/swine-flu-widespread-in-prisons-and-jails-but-deaths-are-few/>;7

Fei Zhou et al., *Clinical Course and Risk Factors for Mortality of Adult Inpatients with COVID-19 in Wuhan, China: A Retrospective Cohort Study*, *The Lancet* (Mar. 9, 2020), [https://www.thelancet.com/journals/lancet/article/PIIS0140-6736\(20\)30566-3/fulltext](https://www.thelancet.com/journals/lancet/article/PIIS0140-6736(20)30566-3/fulltext).....6

ICE Enf’t & Removal Operations, *COVID-19 Pandemic Response Requirements 3 (2020)*, <https://www.ice.gov/doclib/coronavirus/eroCOVID19responseReqsCleanFacilities.pdf>6, 10

ICE Guidance on COVID-19 – Confirmed Cases, <https://www.ice.gov/coronavirus> (last updated May 6, 2020)7, 11

1 Immigration and Customs Enforcement Health Service Corps, Interim Reference
 2 Sheet (Mar. 6, 2020) [https://www.aila.org/File/
 DownloadEmbeddedFile/84066](https://www.aila.org/File/DownloadEmbeddedFile/84066)9

3 *Interim Guidance on Management of Coronavirus Disease 2019 (COVID-19) in*
 4 *Correctional and Detention Facilities*, Ctrs. for Disease Control and
 5 Prevention (Mar. 23, 2020), [https://www.cdc.gov/coronavirus/2019-
 ncov/community/correction-detention/guidance-correctional-detention.html](https://www.cdc.gov/coronavirus/2019-ncov/community/correction-detention/guidance-correctional-detention.html)10

6 Julie Bosman & Jesse McKinley, *One in Five Americans Ordered to Stay Home*
 7 *in Coronavirus Crackdown*, N.Y. Times (Mar. 20, 2020).....5

8 Kenji Mizumoto & Gerardo Chowell, *Estimating Risk of Death from 2019 Novel*
 9 *Coronavirus Disease, China, January–February 2020*, 26 *Emerging*
 10 *Infectious Diseases*, no. 6, June 2020, <https://doi.org/10.3201/eid2606.200233>5

11 Kulish et. al, *The U.S. Tried to Build a New Fleet of Ventilators. The Mission*
 12 *Failed.*, N.Y. Times (Mar. 29, 2020)9

13 Management of Methicillin-Resistant Staphylococcus aureus (MRSA) Infections,
 14 Federal Bureau of Prisons Clinical Practice Guidelines, 1-2 (April 2012)
 15 <https://www.bop.gov/resources/pdfs/mrsa.pdf>8

16 Matthew J. Akiyama, et al., *Flattening the Curve for Incarcerated Populations—*
 17 *Covid-19 in Jails and Prisons*, *New England Journal of Medicine* (April 2,
 18 2020) <https://www.nejm.org/doi/full/10.1056/NEJMp2005687>.....9

19 Melissa Healy, *Coronavirus infection may cause lasting damage throughout the*
 20 *body, doctors fear*, L.A. Times (Apr. 10, 2020), [https://www.latimes.com/
 science/story/2020-04-10/coronavirus-infection-can-do-lasting-damage-to-
 21 the-heart-liver](https://www.latimes.com/science/story/2020-04-10/coronavirus-infection-can-do-lasting-damage-to-the-heart-liver).....6

22 Michael Irvine, et al., *Modeling COVID-19 and impacts on U.S. Immigration and*
 23 *Enforcement (ICE) detention facilities*, *J. Urban Health* (2020),
 24 [https://whistleblower.org/wp-
 content/uploads/2020/04/Irvine_JUH_ICE_COVID19_model.pdf](https://whistleblower.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/04/Irvine_JUH_ICE_COVID19_model.pdf)7

25 Neil M. Ferguson et al., Imperial College of London, *Impact of Non-*
 26 *Pharmaceutical Interventions (NPIs) to Reduce COVID-19 Mortality and*
 27 *Healthcare Demand 7* (2020), [https://www.imperial.ac.uk/media/imperial-
 college/medicine/sph/ide/gida-fellowships/Imperial-College-COVID19-NPI-
 28 modelling-16-03-2020.pdf](https://www.imperial.ac.uk/media/imperial-college/medicine/sph/ide/gida-fellowships/Imperial-College-COVID19-NPI-modelling-16-03-2020.pdf)5

29 Paige St. John, *California to release 3,500 inmates early as coronavirus spreads*
 30 *inside prisons* L.A. Times (Mar. 31, 2020) [https://www.latimes.com/
 california/story/202031-03-/coronavirus-california-release-3500-inmates-
 prisons](https://www.latimes.com/california/story/202031-03-/coronavirus-california-release-3500-inmates-prisons).....11

1 Pam Belluck, *What Does Coronavirus Do to the Body?*, N.Y. Times (Mar. 18,
2 2020) <https://www.nytimes.com/article/coronavirus-body-symptoms.html>.6

3 Roni Caryn Rabin, *Nearly All Patients Hospitalized With Covid-19 Had Chronic*
4 *Health Issues, Study Finds*, N.Y. Times (Apr. 23, 2020)
5 <https://www.nytimes.com/2020/04/23/health/coronavirus-patients-risk.html>7

6 Stephanie M. Lee, *Nearly 900 Immigrants Had The Mumps In Detention Centers*
7 *In The Last Year*, BuzzFeed News (Aug. 29, 2019),
8 [https://www.buzzfeednews.com/article/stephaniemlee/mumps-ice-immigrant-](https://www.buzzfeednews.com/article/stephaniemlee/mumps-ice-immigrant-detention-cdc)
9 [detention-cdc](https://www.buzzfeednews.com/article/stephaniemlee/mumps-ice-immigrant-detention-cdc).....7

10 Tommaso Ebhardt, *99% of Those Who Died From Virus Had Other Illness, Italy*
11 *Says*, Bloomberg (Mar. 18, 2020),
12 [https://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2020-03-18/99-of-those-who-died-](https://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2020-03-18/99-of-those-who-died-from-virus-had-other-illness-italy-says)
13 [from-virus-had-other-illness-italy-says](https://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2020-03-18/99-of-those-who-died-from-virus-had-other-illness-italy-says).....6

14 World Health Organization, *Coronavirus Disease (Covid-19) Pandemic (2020)*,
15 <https://www.who.int/emergencies/diseases/novel-coronavirus-2019> (last
16 updated May 6, 2020)5

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

1 **I. Introduction**

2 *Amici Curiae*, Robert L. Cohen, M.D., Joe Goldenson, M.D., Michael Puisis, D.O.,
3 and Brie Williams, M.D., M.S., a group of medical, public health and human rights experts who
4 are familiar with the unique dangers associated with infectious diseases in detention facilities, urge
5 this court to grant plaintiffs’ petition for writ of habeas corpus and complaint for injunctive and
6 declaratory relief. It is critical that Respondents-Appellants work with local health authorities to
7 release detainees at the Tacoma Northwest Detention Center (“NWDC”) whose continued
8 detention puts them at high risk of contracting SAR-CoV-2, the ‘novel’ coronavirus, which causes
9 COVID-19. Releasing at-risk detainees protects not only those detainees, but also detention
10 facility staff, visitors and the public at large.

11 The novel coronavirus is an extremely infectious virus which causes potentially
12 deadly COVID-19. It has created a global health crisis and led to the adoption and implementation
13 of unprecedented mitigation strategies around the world, including the canceling of public events,
14 the closing of schools and businesses, and stay-at-home orders to the general public. There is no
15 vaccine or cure for COVID-19. The coronavirus can infect and seriously harm anyone. And yet
16 it also is clear that some categories of people are at higher risk than others. In particular, the
17 likelihood that a coronavirus infection will become serious or life-threatening is much higher if
18 the infected person is advanced in age or has certain underlying medical conditions.

19 Managing the spread of coronavirus within detention facilities is critically
20 important because they are enclosed environments, like cruise ships or nursing homes, where one
21 infected person can unleash a rapidly spreading outbreak. The only way to mitigate the risk of
22 serious infection is through hygienic measures such as frequent hand washing and physical
23 distancing that limits exposure. However, these prevention methods are all but impossible to
24 practice or implement in a detention facility setting, such as NWDC, where detainees are crowded
25 together, sleep in dormitory-style rooms, share bathroom products, and rarely have access to
26 sanitizing products. Moreover, once an outbreak occurs, detention facilities are rarely equipped

1 to provide the care and support needed to treat patients suffering from coronavirus infection, or
2 from severe COVID-19.

3 Acting quickly to mitigate the enormous risk associated with detention centers such
4 as NWDC is not just necessary to protect detainees themselves, but also to protect staff and visitors.
5 Because staff and visitors cycle in and out of detention facilities, if appropriate mitigation measures
6 are not taken immediately, those individuals risk spreading the disease to the broader community.
7 Accordingly, the time to act is now, before it is too late.

8 **II. Statement of Interest of Amici Curiae**

9 *Amici curiae* are experts in infectious diseases, healthcare policy, correctional
10 healthcare, human rights, and other related fields who have spent decades studying the provision
11 of healthcare in detention facilities. Based on their experience, and their review of the available
12 information about the COVID-19 pandemic, it is their view that the plaintiffs in this action are at
13 high risk of serious, life-threatening COVID-19 infection, and that their continued confinement in
14 Tacoma's NWDC puts them at a heightened risk of contracting and further spreading COVID-19.

15 *Amici* are committed to ensuring detention facilities provide quality healthcare to
16 detainees, and that detention facilities do not exacerbate the health risks of their detainees. They
17 understand the COVID-19 pandemic has placed enormous strains on society, and are committed
18 to doing their part to ensure that detention facilities take a prudent, science-based approach to
19 addressing the virus. They respectfully submit this brief to offer their view that the NWDC should
20 work with state and local health officials to release individuals to whom COVID-19 poses a high
21 risk of serious infection.

22 *Amici* are the following:

23 Robert L. Cohen, M.D., has worked as a physician, administrator and expert in the
24 care of prisoners for 40 years. Dr. Cohen was the Director of the Montefiore Rikers Island Health
25 Services from 1981 through 1986. In 1986, he was appointed Vice President for Medical
26 Operations of the New York City Health and Hospitals Corporation. Dr. Cohen represented the
27 American Public Health Association on the Board of the National Commission for Correctional

1 Health Care for 17 years. He has served as a federal court-appointed monitor overseeing efforts
2 to improve medical care for prisoners in Florida (*Costello v. Wainwright*), Ohio (*Austin v.*
3 *Wilkinson*), New York (*Milburn v. Coughlin*) and Michigan (*Hadix v. Caruso*). He also has been
4 appointed to oversee the care of all prisoners living with HIV in Connecticut (*Doe v. Meachum*).
5 He currently serves on the nine member New York City Board of Correction, which regulates and
6 oversees New York City's detention facilities.

7 Joe Goldenson, M.D., is a medical physician with 28 years of experience as the
8 Director/Medical Director for Jail Health Services for the San Francisco Department of Public
9 Health. He also has served as a member of the Board of Directors of the National Commission on
10 Correctional Health Care, and was past President of the California chapter of the American
11 Correctional Health Services Association. He has worked extensively as a correctional health
12 medical expert and court monitor. He is currently one of the medical experts retained by the federal
13 district court in *Plata v. Newsome*, Case No. 3:01-cv-01351 (N.D. Cal.), to evaluate medical care
14 provided to inmate patients in the California Department of Correctional Rehabilitation. He also
15 has been a medical expert/monitor for Cook County Jail in Chicago and Los Angeles County Jail,
16 as well as in jails and prisons in Washington State, Texas, Florida, Ohio and Wisconsin.

17 Michael Puisis, M.D., is an internist who has worked in correctional medicine for
18 35 years. He began working at the Cook County Jail as a physician in 1985 and became the
19 Medical Director of Cook County Jail from 1991 to 1996 and Chief Operating Officer for the
20 medical program at the Cook County Jail from 2009 to 2012. He has worked in and managed
21 correctional medical programs in multiple state prisons including in Illinois and New Mexico. He
22 has worked as a monitor or expert for federal courts, and as a correctional medical expert for the
23 Department of Justice, on multiple cases. He also has participated in revisions of national
24 standards for medical care for the National Commission on Correctional Health Care and for the
25 American Public Health Association. He also participated in revising tuberculosis standards for
26 the Centers for Disease Control. Dr. Puisis has edited the only textbook on correctional medicine,
27 *Clinical Practice in Correctional Medicine*.

1 Brie Williams, M.D., M.S., is a Professor of Medicine in the University of
 2 California San Francisco Division of Geriatrics, where she collaborates with colleagues from
 3 criminal justice, public safety and the law to integrate a healthcare perspective into criminal justice
 4 reform. She also co-directs the ARCH (Aging Research in Criminal Justice Health) Network,
 5 funded by the National Institute on Aging, which is a national group of researchers across multiple
 6 disciplines focused on developing evidence to better understand the health and healthcare needs
 7 of older adults and people with serious illness who reside in prisons and jails.

8 **III. Factual Background**

9 *Amici* adopt and incorporate by reference the factual background set forth in
 10 plaintiffs' complaint (Dkt. # 1).

11 **IV. Argument**

12 **A. The COVID-19 Pandemic Requires Proactive Social Distancing Measures**

13 The COVID-19 pandemic is an ongoing pandemic of coronavirus disease 2019 that
 14 is caused by severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2 (SARS-CoV-2). The novel
 15 coronavirus that causes COVID-19 first emerged in the province of Hubei, China in
 16 December 2019.¹ As of May 10, 2020, there were 4,013,728 confirmed cases of COVID-19 and
 17 278,993 deaths worldwide.² Due to the apparent ease with which the virus spreads, these numbers
 18 will continue to rise exponentially without drastic government action.³

19 The consensus of doctors and epidemiologists since the emergence of COVID-19
 20 as a global pandemic has been that the only way to gird against spread of the virus is to take
 21 proactive and early action to “flatten the curve.”⁴ Accordingly, a leading and frequently cited

22 _____
 23 ¹ Kenji Mizumoto & Gerardo Chowell, *Estimating Risk of Death from 2019 Novel Coronavirus Disease, China, January–February 2020*, 26 *Emerging Infectious Diseases*, no. 6, June 2020, <https://doi.org/10.3201/eid2606.200233>.

24 ² World Health Organization, *Coronavirus Disease (Covid-19) Pandemic (2020)*, <https://www.who.int/emergencies/diseases/novel-coronavirus-2019> (last updated May 10, 2020).

25 ³ *See* Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, *Situation Summary (2020)*, [cdc.gov/coronavirus/2019-ncov/cases-updates/summary.html](https://www.cdc.gov/coronavirus/2019-ncov/cases-updates/summary.html).

26 ⁴ *See, e.g.*, Neil M. Ferguson et al., *Imperial College of London, Impact of Non-Pharmaceutical Interventions (NPIs) to Reduce COVID-19 Mortality and Healthcare Demand 7 (2020)*, <https://www.imperial.ac.uk/media/imperial-college/medicine/sph/ide/gida-fellowships/Imperial-College-COVID19-NPI-modelling-16-03-2020.pdf>.

1 report from the Imperial College London has suggested that “suppression will minimally require
 2 a combination of social distancing of the entire population, home isolation of cases and household
 3 quarantine of their family members,” in addition to school and university closures.⁵ In other
 4 words, social distancing is necessary at every level, including the institutional level. Given the
 5 speed with which the virus spreads, such social distancing measures may have to last
 6 approximately 18 months until a vaccine is successfully developed.⁶ It is for precisely this reason
 7 that dozens of state governments have instituted mandatory social distancing policies in recent
 8 days; indeed, one in five Americans is now under order to stay home.⁷

9 The coronavirus has wreaked havoc all over the United States, jeopardizing both
 10 the health and economic well-being of millions of Americans.⁸ The United States now has over
 11 one *million* cases and over 70,000 fatalities.⁹ It has been approximated that 3.4% of infected
 12 persons die.¹⁰ Even patients who recover might suffer from permanent damage to their lungs and
 13 other vital organs.¹¹ Accordingly, social distancing should not only be practiced, but also
 14 mandated and enforced by all levels of government and their institutions.

15 **B. The Danger Is Greatest for People Over 50 or with Underlying Illnesses**

16 Emerging data suggests that 16% of people infected with COVID-19 will develop
 17 serious illness. About 1% of infected persons die.¹² Even those patients who ultimately recover
 18
 19

20 ⁵ *Id.* at 1.

21 ⁶ *Id.* at 15.

22 ⁷ Julie Bosman & Jesse McKinley, *One in Five Americans Ordered to Stay Home in Coronavirus Crackdown*, N.Y. Times (Mar. 20, 2020), <https://www.nytimes.com/2020/03/20/us/ny-ca-stay-home-order.html>.

23 ⁸ *See generally* Alexis C. Madrigal & Robinson Meyer, *How the Coronavirus Became an American Catastrophe*, The Atlantic (Mar. 21, 2020), <https://www.theatlantic.com/health/archive/2020/03/how-many-americans-are-sick-lost-february/608521/>.

24 ⁹ Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, *Coronavirus Disease 2019 (COVID-19): Cases and Latest Updates*, <https://www.cdc.gov/coronavirus/2019-ncov/cases-updates/cases-in-us.html> (last updated May 10, 2020).

25 ¹⁰ *See* ICE Enf’t & Removal Operations, *COVID-19 Pandemic Response Requirements 3* (2020), <https://www.ice.gov/doclib/coronavirus/eroCOVID19responseReqsCleanFacilities.pdf>.

26 ¹¹ Melissa Healy, *Coronavirus infection may cause lasting damage throughout the body, doctors fear*, L.A. Times (Apr. 10, 2020) <https://www.latimes.com/science/story/2020-04-10/coronavirus-infection-can-do-lasting-damage-to-the-heart-liver>.

27 ¹² Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, *Coronavirus Disease 2019 (COVID-19): Situation Summary* (2020), <https://www.cdc.gov/coronavirus/2019-ncov/summary.html>.

1 might suffer from permanent damage to their lungs and other vital organs.¹³ Such serious cases
 2 of COVID-19 overwhelmingly afflict older individuals and individuals with underlying chronic
 3 health conditions, such as heart disease, lung disease, liver disease, kidney disease, diabetes and
 4 other immunodeficiency problems.¹⁴ Early data from Italy, the site of one of the earliest and
 5 deadliest major outbreaks, is instructive: the average age of those who died from the virus there
 6 is 79.5; 99% of fatalities were in individuals who suffered from one or more prior illnesses; 75%
 7 had high blood pressure, about 35% had diabetes, and about 33% had heart disease.¹⁵ Similar
 8 stories are now occurring in this country. According to a recent study about the virus' impact in
 9 New York City, the site of the worst outbreak in the United States, almost all hospitalized patients
 10 had at least one underlying health condition.¹⁶ In short, COVID-19 presents a tremendous danger
 11 to older individuals and those suffering from underlying conditions.

12 C. Detention Centers Are at a Heightened Risk for the Spread of COVID-19

13 Detention centers like NWDC, which are enclosed, congregate environments in
 14 which it is impossible to implement and enforce social distancing, are at a heightened risk for the
 15 spread of coronavirus. Numerous public health officials have recognized that outbreaks of
 16 contagious diseases are more common in detention settings than in communities at large.¹⁷ Indeed,
 17 over 780 confirmed cases of coronavirus have emerged in ICE facilities.¹⁸ Given the dearth of
 18

19 ¹³ Pam Belluck, *What Does Coronavirus Do to the Body?*, N.Y. Times (Mar. 18, 2020),
 20 <https://www.nytimes.com/article/coronavirus-body-symptoms.html>.

21 ¹⁴ Fei Zhou et al., *Clinical Course and Risk Factors for Mortality of Adult Inpatients with COVID-19 in Wuhan, China: A Retrospective Cohort Study*, The Lancet (Mar. 9, 2020), [https://www.thelancet.com/journals/lancet/article/PIIS0140-6736\(20\)30566-3/fulltext](https://www.thelancet.com/journals/lancet/article/PIIS0140-6736(20)30566-3/fulltext).

22 ¹⁵ Tommaso Ehardt, *99% of Those Who Died From Virus Had Other Illness, Italy Says*, Bloomberg
 23 (Mar. 18, 2020), <https://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2020-03-18/99-of-those-who-died-from-virus-had-other-illness-italy-says>.

24 ¹⁶ Roni Caryn Rabin, *Nearly All Patients Hospitalized With Covid-19 Had Chronic Health Issues, Study Finds*, N.Y.
 25 Times (Apr. 23, 2020) <https://www.nytimes.com/2020/04/23/health/coronavirus-patients-risk.html>.

26 ¹⁷ See David Reuter, *Swine Flu Widespread in Prisons and Jails, but Deaths are Few*, Prison Legal News (Feb. 15,
 27 2010), <https://www.prisonlegalnews.org/news/2010/feb/15/swine-flu-widespread-in-prisons-and-jails-but-deaths-are-few/>; Bianca Malcolm, *The Rise of Methicillin-Resistant Staphylococcus aureus in U.S. Correctional Populations*, Journal of Correctional Health Care (May 13, 2011), <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC3116074/>; Stephanie M. Lee, *Nearly 900 Immigrants Had The Mumps In Detention Centers In The Last Year*, BuzzFeed News (Aug. 29, 2019), <https://www.buzzfeednews.com/article/stephaniemlee/mumps-ice-immigrant-detention-cdc>.

28 ¹⁸ *ICE Guidance on COVID-19 – Confirmed Cases*, <https://www.ice.gov/coronavirus> (last updated May 8, 2020).

1 testing, these numbers likely dramatically understate the problem.¹⁹ One study using data from
2 early March has found that under an optimistic scenario, 72% of individuals in ICE facilities would
3 be expected to be infected within 90 days, while under a more pessimistic scenario, nearly 100%
4 of detainees would be infected by day 90.²⁰

5 The risk for widespread contagion is exacerbated by the fact that staff, visitors,
6 contractors and vendors all pass between communities and detention facilities, and each group can
7 bring infectious diseases into and out of those facilities. Moreover, the detainees themselves have
8 to make court appearances and, each time they appear, they risk contracting infections and
9 introducing them into the detention facility upon return. Additionally, detention facility
10 populations are constantly turning over, as detainees cycle in and out of detention, with each new
11 detainee potentially carrying coronavirus and introducing it into the facility's population. This
12 problem is especially acute in the context of these immigration detention facilities, where it is
13 common to see detainees transferred between facilities, exacerbating a risk of spread throughout
14 the system.

15 These factors, all of which make it effectively impossible for detention facilities to
16 protect themselves from outbreaks outside their walls, are made worse by the fact that it is difficult
17 to identify and isolate individuals who are infected, who may suffer from only mild symptoms or
18 even be entirely asymptomatic while still carrying and spreading the disease. Indeed, as many as
19 1 in 4 cases of coronavirus will not present symptoms and yet remain contagious.²¹ Unfortunately,
20 detention facilities typically do not have the ability to perform the kind of systematic screening
21 and testing that would be required to ensure that the virus does not enter or circulate within these
22 facilities.

23 The unique attributes of detention facilities also make it impossible to adopt and
24 implement the mitigation efforts that have become a necessary safeguard of life outside these

25 ¹⁹ *See id.*

26 ²⁰ Michael Irvine, et al., *Modeling COVID-19 and impacts on U.S. Immigration and Enforcement (ICE) detention*
27 *facilities*, J. Urban Health (2020), [https://whistleblower.org/wp-](https://whistleblower.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/04/Irvine_JUH_ICE_COVID19_model.pdf)
28 [content/uploads/2020/04/Irvine_JUH_ICE_COVID19_model.pdf](https://whistleblower.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/04/Irvine_JUH_ICE_COVID19_model.pdf).

²¹ Apoorva Mandavilli, *Infected but Feeling Fine: The Unwitting Coronavirus Spreaders*, N.Y. Times (Mar. 31,
2020), <https://www.nytimes.com/2020/03/31/health/coronavirus-asymptomatic-transmission.html>.

1 facilities. That is because immigration detention facilities are enclosed environments, much like
2 the cruise ships, naval carriers or nursing homes that have proven susceptible to COVID-19
3 outbreaks. The social distancing that has been the hallmark of the United States' COVID-19
4 prevention efforts has not proven possible in such detention settings. Detainees share close
5 quarters, including shared living quarters and bunk beds, dining halls, bathrooms, showers,
6 telephones, law libraries and other common areas, each presenting dangerous opportunities for
7 transmission.²² Spaces within detention facilities are poorly ventilated, which promotes the spread
8 of diseases. Other hygiene-based prevention strategies are similarly lacking in a detention setting.
9 Detainees do not typically have access to sufficient soap and alcohol-based sanitizers to engage in
10 the kind of frequent hand washing recommended throughout the rest of the country. At best, staff
11 can only sporadically clean or sanitize high-touch surfaces like door handles, light switches or
12 telephones. In fact, in these facilities detainees themselves have to clean the facility without
13 adequate supplies or protective equipment, which further exposes them to infection.

14 Once an outbreak occurs, it is extremely difficult to properly treat those who
15 become infected or limit the spread of the virus. COVID-19's most common symptoms are fever,
16 cough and shortness of breath. Serious cases can require invasive measures to manage respiratory
17 function, including the use of highly specialized equipment like ventilators. While serious
18 infections have developed in all demographics, they are much more likely to occur in high-risk
19 populations. The coronavirus epidemic has created a high demand for ventilators and resulted in
20 short supply around the world.²³ The virus even has led to shortages of less specialized equipment
21 such as dialysis machines, face masks and gloves.²⁴

22 The necessary clinical management for those infected with coronavirus, especially
23 those in high-risk populations, is labor-intensive. It requires that nurses tend to a limited number

24 ²² Poor inmate hygiene has in previous years led to staph infection outbreaks, spread by, *inter alia*, the shared use
25 of soap and towels and person-to-person contact via contaminated hands. See Management of Methicillin-
26 Resistant Staphylococcus aureus (MRSA) Infections, Federal Bureau of Prisons Clinical Practice Guidelines, 1-2
(April 2012), <https://www.bop.gov/resources/pdfs/mrsa.pdf>.

27 ²³ Kulish et. al, *The U.S. Tried to Build a New Fleet of Ventilators. The Mission Failed.*, N.Y. Times (Mar. 29,
2020), <https://www.nytimes.com/2020/03/29/business/coronavirus-us-ventilator-shortage.html>.

28 ²⁴ See Andrew Jacobs, et al., 'At War With No Ammo': Doctors Say Shortage of Protective Gear Is Dire, N.Y. Times
(Mar. 19, 2020) <https://www.nytimes.com/2020/03/19/health/coronavirus-masks-shortage.html>.

1 of patients at a time, and often requires physicians with specialized backgrounds in infectious
 2 diseases, respiratory, cardiac and kidney care. Immigration detention facilities are unable to
 3 address these needs. The novel coronavirus outbreak is already straining hospital capacity across
 4 the country. The problem will be dangerously exacerbated if ICE does not act immediately to
 5 reduce those detainees who are at the greatest risk of serious infection.²⁵

6 **D. IHSC’s Recommendations to Combat COVID-19 Are Inadequate**

7 ICE Health Service Corps (“IHSC”) is the entity responsible for overseeing medical
 8 care in ICE detention facilities. On March 6, 2020, IHSC released interim guidelines to combat
 9 COVID-19.²⁶ Those guidelines, however, were woefully inadequate in light of the serious
 10 concerns outlined above. Among other things, the guidelines: 1) focused on questioning detainees
 11 about travel and potential contact with individuals with COVID-19, even though the disease is
 12 already widely spread in the U.S.; 2) failed to include simple measures recommended by the CDC
 13 to stop the spread of infections in institutional settings, such as access to hand sanitizer and use of
 14 masks; 3) failed to advise detention facility staff on planning for disease surges as illness spread,
 15 even though that spread would inevitably result in an increase in patients and a decrease in staff
 16 due to illness; 4) failed to advise detention facility staff on when to test for COVID-19; 5) failed
 17 to establish adequate protocols for isolating and monitoring detainees with coronavirus, instead
 18 treating the disease as a rare occurrence even though many new detainees may already have been
 19 infected with coronavirus; and 6) provided no guidance, training or protections for detainees when
 20 they enter detention.²⁷

21 On April 10, 2020, ICE issued a new guidance document which “assists ICE
 22 detention facility operators to sustain detention operations, while mitigating risk to the safety and
 23 well-being of detainees, staff, contractors, visitors, and stakeholders due to COVID-19.”²⁸ This

24
 25 ²⁵ Matthew J. Akiyama, et al., *Flattening the Curve for Incarcerated Populations—Covid-19 in Jails and Prisons*,
 New England Journal of Medicine (April 2, 2020), <https://www.nejm.org/doi/full/10.1056/NEJMp2005687>.

26 ²⁶ See Immigration and Customs Enforcement Health Service Corps, Interim Reference Sheet (Mar. 6, 2020),
<https://www.aila.org/File/DownloadEmbeddedFile/84066>.

27 ²⁷ Id.

28 ²⁸ ICE Enf’t & Removal Operations, COVID-19 Pandemic Response Requirements 3 (2020), <https://www.ice.gov/doclib/coronavirus/eroCOVID19responseReqsCleanFacilities.pdf>.

1 new document is still inadequate: much of the guidance is permissive or aspirational, rather than
 2 mandatory. For example, the guidance “encourage[s] staff to maintain a distance greater than six
 3 feet” from individuals appearing ill “[w]hen feasible and consistent with security priorities” and
 4 acknowledges that “strict social distancing may not be possible.”²⁹ As recognized by a federal
 5 district judge in his April 20 order, the document also includes no mention of any enforcement
 6 mechanisms.³⁰ Moreover, the new ICE guidance came far too late. The guidance primarily serves
 7 to operationalize CDC’s Interim Guidance for Correctional and Detention Facilities, which was
 8 released almost three weeks prior.³¹ There are now at least 705 confirmed cases out of only 1,460
 9 tested throughout the system among detainees in ICE custody, and 102 confirmed cases among
 10 ICE employees at detention centers.³² This is in the context of very low testing levels: less than
 11 5% of the total detained population has been tested.³³

12 In short, these ICE guidelines fall far short of setting forth the sort of comprehensive
 13 and proactive social distancing measures that are necessary to prevent viral spread or to treat those
 14 who become infected. The current ICE approach will result in many preventable illnesses and
 15 deaths—in particular among people with high-risk characteristics, such as Plaintiffs in this case.
 16 Other governments appear to have recognized this risk and acted accordingly by releasing
 17 thousands from carceral settings.³⁴ ICE must also fully recognize this risk.

18 **V. Conclusion**

19 For these reasons, NWDC officials should work with local health departments to
 20 release detainees who are at a high risk of serious COVID-19 infection. *Amici* urge the Court to
 21

22 ²⁹ *Id.* at 13.

23 ³⁰ Order (1) GRANTING Motions to File Amicus Briefs (Dkt. Nos. 117, 119); (2) GRANTING Plaintiffs’
 Emergency Motion to Certify Subclass (Dkt. No. 83); (3) GRANTING Plaintiffs’ Motion for Preliminary
 Injunction (Dkt. No. 81); and DENYING AS MOOT Plaintiffs’ Ex Parte Application to File Supplement (Dkt.
 24 No. 127) (IN CHAMBERS) at 30, *Fraihat v. ICE*, No. 19-1546 (C.D. Cal. Apr. 20, 2020).

25 ³¹ *See Interim Guidance on Management of Coronavirus Disease 2019 (COVID-19) in Correctional and Detention*
Facilities, Ctrs. for Disease Control and Prevention (Mar. 23, 2020), <https://www.cdc.gov/coronavirus/2019-ncov/community/correction-detention/guidance-correctional-detention.html>.

26 ³² *ICE Guidance on COVID-19 – Confirmed Cases*, <https://www.ice.gov/coronavirus> (last updated May 8, 2020).

27 ³³ *See id.*

28 ³⁴ *See, e.g.,* Paige St. John, *California to release 3,500 inmates early as coronavirus spreads inside prisons*, L.A.
 Times (Mar. 31, 2020), <https://www.latimes.com/california/story/2020-03-31/coronavirus-california-release-3500-inmates-prisons>.

1 consider this information when assessing whether to grant plaintiffs’ petition for habeas corpus, as
2 well as plaintiffs requested injunctive and declaratory relief.

3 Dated: May 12, 2020

GIBBS HOUSTON PAUW

4
5

/s/ _____

6
7
8
9
10

Robert Gibbs
Washington State Bar No. 5932
GIBBS HOUSTON PAUW
1000 Second Avenue, Suite 1600
Seattle, WA 98104
Telephone: (206) 682-1080
Facsimile: (206) 689-2270
rgibbs@ghp-law.net

11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19

Susanna M. Buergel (*pro hac vice
forthcoming*)
Darren W. Johnson (*pro hac vice
forthcoming*)
David C. Kimball-Stanley (*pro hac vice
forthcoming*)
PAUL, WEISS, RIFKIND,
WHARTON & GARRISON LLP
1285 Avenue of the Americas
New York, NY 10019-6064
Telephone: (212) 373-3000
Facsimile: (212) 757-3990
sbuergel@paulweiss.com
djohnson@paulweiss.com
dkimball-stanley@paulweiss.com

20
21

Counsel for Amici Curiae

22
23
24
25
26
27
28